

University of Warwick institutional repository

This paper is made available online in accordance with publisher policies. Please scroll down to view the document itself. Please refer to the repository record for this item and our policy information available from the repository home page for further information.

To see the final version of this paper please visit the publisher's website. Access to the published version may require a subscription.

Author(s): Gad Frankel, Robert K. Shaw, David Pink, Cedric N. Berger and Paul Hand

Article Title: Fresh produce as a potential vector for bacterial human pathogens

Year of publication: 2009

Link to published version :

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1751-7915.2009.00137.x>

Publisher statement: The definitive version is available at www.blackwell-synergy.com

Fresh produce as a potential vector for bacterial human pathogens

Journal:	<i>Microbial Biotechnology</i>
Manuscript ID:	MICROBIO-2009-074
Manuscript Type:	Editorial
Date Submitted by the Author:	18-Jun-2009
Complete List of Authors:	Frankel, Gad; Imperial College, CMMI Shaw, Robert; imperial College, cmmi Pink, David; University of Warwick Berger, Cedric; imperial College, cmmi; Imperial College Hand, Paul; University of Warwick
Keywords:	adhesion, agricultural biotechnology, bacteria, microbe:higher organism interactions

Fresh produce as a potential vector for bacterial human pathogens

Gad Frankel¹, Robert K. Shaw¹, David Pink², Cedric Berger¹, Paul Hand²

¹Centre for Molecular Microbiology and Infection, Imperial College, London and

²Warwick-HRI, University of Warwick, Warwick, UK

*For correspondence: Gad Frankel, CMMI, Flowers Building, Imperial College,
London SW7 2AZ, UK. Tel: +44 20 7594 5253; electronic mail:
g.frankel@imperial.ac.uk

1
2
3
4 The predicted massive growth in the world overall population and the proportion of
5
6 the elderly together with climate change and water shortages pose major global
7
8 challenges in ensuring food security, both in terms of availability and safety. The
9
10 geographic and demographic changes are likely to force unprecedented changes in
11
12 land usage and agricultural practices (i.e. bringing closer together animal and crop
13
14 production and the need to recycle water), which might increase the risk of
15
16 contamination. Fresh produce, particularly salad leaves that are consumed raw, is
17
18 becoming an increasingly important source of human infections. Despite the
19
20 increasing risk to public health little is currently known about the mechanism though
21
22 which human pathogens bind to leaf surfaces or the plant traits that facilitate bacterial
23
24 attachment.
25
26
27
28
29

30 Enteric pathogens such as enterohaemorrhagic *E. coli* (EHEC) O157:H7 and
31
32 *Salmonella enterica*, which are ranked as key food-borne pathogens of humans, are
33
34 often attributed to consumption or handling of contaminated bovine or chicken
35
36 products. However, recent outbreaks of food poisoning have been associated with
37
38 consumption of contaminated vegetable or salad produce and evidence suggests that
39
40 such outbreaks are increasing (reviewed in Holden *et al.*, 2009; Little and Gillespie
41
42 2008). Examples of international outbreaks of *S. enterica* and EHEC O157 linked to
43
44 ready-to-eat plant produce include a Scandinavian/UK outbreak of *S. Thompson*
45
46 infection associated with consumption of rocket leaves; a Danish outbreak of *S.*
47
48 *Anatum* infection linked to imported basil an outbreak of *S. Typhimurium* DT204b in
49
50 several European countries associated with consumption of lettuce and an outbreak of
51
52 *S. Senftenberg* infection associated with imported Israeli basil affecting the UK,
53
54 Denmark, the Netherlands and the USA (Pezzoli *et al.*, 2008). The largest EHEC
55
56 O157 outbreak to date, in 1996 in Sakai City, Osaka, Japan, was traced to
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 consumption of white radish sprouts. In 2005 an outbreak affecting 120 people on the
4 west coast of Sweden was linked to iceberg lettuce and in 2006 a severe outbreak that
5 affected many parts of the United States was traced to contamination of pre-packed
6 spinach from California (reviewed in Holden *et al.*, 2009; Little and Gillespie 2008).
7
8
9

10
11
12 Numerous studies have investigated the potential sources of vegetable contamination
13 both pre-harvest in the field and post-harvest in the food chain. During the pre-harvest
14 phase, the potential exists for persistent pathogen populations to establish on growing
15 crops and then the risk to be amplified postharvest either by further direct
16 contamination or by proliferation of existing pathogen populations during processing
17 and handling procedures. Contamination in the field may occur because of application
18 of inadequately composted manures or sewage, insect transmission, water run-off
19 from nearby animal pastures or exposure to contaminated feces of wild animals.
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31

32
33 The risk associated with using water from a range of sources and microbiological
34 qualities for irrigation of salads and vegetables has been assessed and the need for
35 improved guidelines recognized (Hamilton *et al.*, 2006). Certainly in lettuce plants,
36 surface irrigation and spray irrigation with suspensions of *E. coli* O157:H7 lead to
37 recovery of the pathogen from lettuce tissue 20 days later. The lettuce remained
38 contaminated with *E. coli* O157:H7 even after washing, indicating that irrigation of
39 food crops with water of unknown microbiological quality poses significant hazards.
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49 In the UK and Europe, legislation has moved responsibility for fresh produce safety
50 away from government and into the supply chain, and retailers and producers have
51 made significant progress in driving safety in production procedures through use of
52 their own or other recognized standards (Monaghan, 2006). However, despite these
53 efforts significant food poisoning incidents related to consumption of fresh produce
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 are still reported, indicating that under certain conditions inoculation and survival of
4
5 human pathogens continues to occur.
6
7

8
9 There have been a very large number of studies of the persistence of human
10
11 pathogens on plants. Most studies have focused on the survival of *E. coli* (largely *E.*
12
13 *coli* O157:H7) and *Salmonella* sprayed or applied directly on to foliage of plants in
14
15 some way, or applied on seeds, roots or into soil. With so many different experimental
16
17 systems it is difficult to make general statements concerning population dynamics and
18
19 survival of human pathogens on crop plants. Nevertheless, when applied directly to
20
21 foliage or into soil, both *E. coli* and *Salmonella* are able to survive for extensive
22
23 periods of time: >100 days on foliage and >5 months in soil (reviewed in Holden *et*
24
25 *al.*, 2009). Importantly, standard post-harvest decontamination procedures with
26
27 solutions containing approximately 20-200 µg/ml free chlorine for various lengths of
28
29 time can reduce bacterial numbers but do not eliminate either the natural microbial
30
31 population or human pathogens completely.
32
33
34
35

36
37 The phyllosphere is characterized by a number of extreme and often fluctuating
38
39 environmental conditions combined with unique physio-chemical characteristics, to
40
41 which typical phyllosphere microorganisms show a number of adaptations, allowing
42
43 them to grow in these habitats. Human pathogens are not normally considered a part
44
45 of the phyllosphere microbial population but it is clear that they do occur, as
46
47 evidenced by the outbreaks of food poisoning described above. We recently reviewed
48
49 the ecology of human pathogens in relation to the phyllosphere (Whipps *et al.*, 2008)
50
51 and concluded that human pathogens can survive successfully in the phyllosphere of
52
53 crop plants. We identified a need to understand the bacterial factors controlling
54
55 attachment to intact and cut plant surfaces, the role of genetic variation in plants for a
56
57 propensity for colonization of the phyllosphere by human pathogens and to identify
58
59
60

1
2
3 those plant characteristics which could be manipulated through crop genetics to
4 decrease pathogenic bacteria attachment and survival.
5
6

7
8 While environmental and genetic factors play a critical role in determining patterns of
9 phyllosphere colonization by bacteria, including human pathogens, much less is
10 known of plant related factors which determine the potential for human pathogens to
11 colonize, grow or survive as epiphytes or endophytes on or in leaves. Plant defense
12 mechanisms have been shown to respond to the presence of such pathogens. Genome-
13 wide analysis of the transcriptional response of *A. thaliana* to a plant pathogen and *E.*
14 *coli* O157:H7 infiltrated into the leaf tissues identified many genes in common,
15 suggesting the presence of common effector molecules in both bacteria (Thilmony *et al.*,
16 2006). Development of the microbial population in the phyllosphere will also be
17 determined by phenotypic characteristics of the plant, certainly, there are “hot-spots”
18 of microbial growth on the leaf associated with specific sites. Gross plant morphology
19 is known to influence the size of phyllosphere bacterial populations and variation in
20 bacterial populations between different species have been attributed to a range of
21 plant characteristics, including leaf water content, leaf P content, amounts of bacteria-
22 inhibitory phenolics, and leaf and mesophyll thickness (Yadav *et al.*, 2005). There
23 have been very few studies of plant cultivar effects on human pathogens: however a
24 recent report demonstrated a differential interaction between lettuce cultivars and
25 *Salmonella enterica* serovars (Klerks *et al.*, 2007).
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49

50
51 However, such a complex interaction is likely to be under the control of multiple plant
52 and bacterial genes. An understanding of the mechanisms involved could lead to a
53 reduction in pathogenic microorganisms on fresh produce and thereby a decrease in
54 the risk of food-borne illness. A powerful approach to understanding and exploiting
55 the underlying plant genetics would be quantitative genetic analysis on selected plant
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 species using appropriate experimental mapping populations. Genetic analysis to
4 identify quantitative trait loci (QTL) allows the dissection of continuous phenotypic
5 variation into contributions from discrete genetic factors based on the use of DNA
6 markers. To do this a suitable mapping population is required with a clear differential
7 parental response to the trait(s) of interest for construction of a genetic linkage map
8 and also for the collection of 'robust' phenotypic data for the traits through properly
9 designed replicated experiments. It is possible to determine whether QTL are specific
10 to certain plant tissues, developmental stages or structures. For example, a study on
11 shelf life of 'baby leaf' lettuce identified QTL for properties such as cell wall
12 strength, stomatal index and epidermal cell area and suggested that bacterial
13 colonization could play a role in post-harvest performance. As discussed earlier, plant
14 characteristics such as these could indeed have a significant effect on pathogenic
15 bacteria.

16
17
18 In conclusion, in face of the continuing potential risk to human health from
19 consumption of contaminated fresh produce, there is a need to investigate microbe –
20 plant interactions at both the phenotypic, genetic and molecular levels. Performing
21 parallel complementary studies on the pathogen and the host crop will allow a better
22 understanding of the factors affecting colonization of the phyllosphere by human
23 pathogens which will ultimately form the basis of development of better control and
24 decontamination strategies leading to production of safer produce.

25 26 27 **Acknowledgments**

28
29 We thank the BBSRC for supporting our microbe-plant interaction project.
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

References

Hamilton, A.J., Stagnitti, F., Premier, R., Boland, A.M., and Hale, G. (2006) Quantitative microbial risk assessment models for consumption of raw vegetables irrigated with reclaimed water. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **72**: 3284-90.

Holden, N., Pritchard, L., and Toth, I. (2009) Colonization outwith the colon: plants as an alternative environmental reservoir for human pathogenic enterobacteria. *FEMS Microbiol Rev* **33**: 689-703.

Klerks,, M.M., Franz, E., van Gent-Pelzer, M., Zijlstra, C., van Bruggen, A.H. (2007) Differential interaction of *Salmonella enterica* serovars with lettuce cultivars and plant-microbe factors influencing the colonization efficiency. *ISME J* **1**: 620-31.

Monaghan, J.M. (2006) United Kingdom and European Approach to Fresh Produce Food Safety and Security. *HortTechnology* **16**: 559-562.

Little, C.L., Gillespie, I.A. (2008) Prepared salads and public health. *J Appl Microbiol* **105**: 1729-43.

Pezzoli L., et al., (2007) Packed with *Salmonella*--investigation of an international outbreak of *Salmonella* Senftenberg infection linked to contamination of prepacked basil in 2007. *Foodborne Pathog Dis* **5**: 661-8

Thilmony R, Underwood W, He SY (2006) Genome-wide transcriptional analysis of the *Arabidopsis thaliana* interaction with the plant pathogen *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. tomato DC3000 and the human pathogen *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. *Plant J* **46**, 34-53.

Whipps, J.M., Hand, P., Pink, D.A., and Bending, G.D. Human pathogens and the phyllosphere. *Adv Appl Microbiol* **64**: 183-221.

1
2
3 Yadav, R.K., Karamanoli, K., and Vokou, D. (2005) Bacterial colonization of the
4
5
6 phyllosphere of mediterranean perennial species as influenced by leaf structural and
7
8 chemical features. *Microb Ecol* **50**:185-96
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

For Review Only