

Manuscript version: Author's Accepted Manuscript

The version presented in WRAP is the author's accepted manuscript and may differ from the published version or Version of Record.

Persistent WRAP URL:

<http://wrap.warwick.ac.uk/168956>

How to cite:

The repository item page linked to above, will contain details on accessing citation guidance from the publisher.

Copyright and reuse:

The Warwick Research Archive Portal (WRAP) makes this work of researchers of the University of Warwick available open access under the following conditions.

This article is made available under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International license (CC BY 4.0) and may be reused according to the conditions of the license. For more details see: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>.



Publisher's statement:

Please refer to the repository item page, publisher's statement section, for further information.

For more information, please contact the WRAP Team at: wrap@warwick.ac.uk

The Tiger's Teeth: Local Gazetteers as Sources for Images Related to the Performance of Ritual

Anne Gerritsen
University of Warwick
August 2022

In 1756, a scholar by the name of Ouyang Zhenghuan 歐陽正煥 (1709-1760) published a new gazetteer for Xiangtan 湘潭 county in Hunan province.¹ To modern historians, Xiangtan may be best known as the county of Mao Zedong's birth, but during the reign of the Qianlong emperor (1736-1795), the county seems to have wanted to make a name for itself as a place with outstanding ritual implements. *Juan* 8 of this 1756 edition of the Xiangtan gazetteer has a large number of pages with detailed illustrations associated with the performance of Confucian rituals (*li* 禮). First, there is a page with the schematic lay-out of the implements required for the performance of ritual (陳設圖).² Then follow 34 single pages depicting the full complement of ritual vessels 禮器, including such items as the bamboo bowl for food offerings (*bian* 簋), the stemmed cup (*dou* 豆) and the mountain vessel (*shanzun* 山尊) for offering wine (see Figure 1).³ These are followed by a further 19 single pages depicting the 21 separate musical instruments (樂器), including the starter (a wooden crate or box) and the stopper (a wooden, tiger-shaped object), and the elaborate

¹ Ouyang Zhenghuan 歐陽正煥 and Lü Zhengyin 呂正音, eds., *Xiangtan xian zhi* 湘潭縣志, Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project (Shanben fangzhi), 1756.

² *Juan* 8, 24a-b.

³ *Juan* 8, 27a-42b; Wu Hung, 'The Art of "Ritual Artifacts" (Liqi): Discourse and Practice', in *A Companion to Chinese Art*, ed. Martin Powers and Katherine R. Tsiang (Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, 2016), 233–53.

stands used for banners and flags (Figure 2).⁴ Finally, there are 24 gazetteer pages with ritual postures or dance moves, each page displaying four separate postures, followed by a page depicting the feather plume (*di* 翟) and flute (*yue* 籥), to be held in the left and right hands, respectively, as well as the hat, belt, robe and boots to be worn by the dancers.⁵ The quality of the images is excellent: each of the objects is depicted in elaborate detail, as both figures show.

This extensive set of images depicts the lay-out of the rituals and all the objects that were to be used in the performance of Confucian rituals in Xiangtan. Their inclusion in the gazetteer of an otherwise hardly outstanding county, raises several questions. What exactly is this category of objects, depicted in such detail in this gazetteer? When did images of ritual objects begin to appear in local gazetteers, and why are they included in this genre? How do these images in local gazetteers relate to the textual and visual representations of ritual implements in state-level illustrated ritual manuals? Generally speaking, rituals, ritual performance, ritual manuals and ritual implements have garnered extensive scholarly attention, but gazetteers have rarely been seen as a particularly valuable sources for approaching the topic. Kai-wing Chow's 1994 book on ritualism in late imperial China, for example, does not draw on the genre of local gazetteers.⁶ Joseph Lam's 1998 work on the performance of state rituals during the Ming dynasty, with special focus on the role of music

⁴ *Xiangtan xianzhi*, juan 8, 48a-58a.; see the description of these instruments and their function in Joseph S. C. Lam, 'Musical Confucianism: The Case of "Jikong Yuewu"', in *On Sacred Grounds: Culture, Society, Politics, and the Formation of the Cult of Confucius*, ed. Thomas A Wilson (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center, 2002), 148–50.

⁵ *Xiangtan xianzhi*, juan 8, 58b-71b; on the history of representations of ritual dance, see Nicolas Standaert, 'Ritual Dances and Their Visual Representations in the Ming and the Qing', *The East Asian Library Journal* 12, no. 1 (2006): 68–181.

⁶ Kai-wing Chow, *The Rise of Confucian Ritualism in Late Imperial China: Ethics, Classics, and Lineage Discourse* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1994).

in the imperial sacrifice, does not use local gazetteers.⁷ Angela Zito's book on Qing ritual of the same year does not either.⁸ Macabe Keliher's recent book (2019) on ritual and the Qing state focuses on the Board of Rites and demonstrates the importance of ritual in the shaping of a specifically Qing administrative order from Ming precedent, and its institutionalization and codification in the second half of the seventeenth century, but local gazetteers do not feature.⁹ Nicolas Standaert's 2006 study of the visual representations of ritual dances does mention gazetteers.¹⁰ But these are very specific gazetteers, namely: Queli gazetteer, with a preface dated to 1505, which is the gazetteer for Qufu, where Confucius was born, *Nanyong zhi*, the gazetteer of the Imperial Academy in Nanjing, and *Huang Ming Taixue zhi*, the gazetteer of the National University in Beijing.¹¹ None of these forms part of the genre of *difang zhi*, local gazetteers. Lai Yu-chih's recent exploration of image and ritual in the formation and influence of one of the most extensive illustrated ritual manuals published in the mid-eighteenth century also does not take account of its impact on the genre of local gazetteers.¹²

The argument this contribution seeks to make, then, is that local gazetteers should be considered among the valuable sources for the study of Confucian ritual. When we look closely at the visual material about ritual in local gazetteers, we see, for example that the process of the appearance of images of ritual implements in local gazetteers should not be

⁷ Joseph S. C. Lam, *State Sacrifices and Music in Ming China: Orthodoxy, Creativity and Expressiveness*, SUNY Series in Chinese Local Studies (Albany, N.Y.: State University of New York Press, 1998).

⁸ Angela Zito, *Of Body and Brush: Grand Sacrifice as Text/Performance in Eighteenth-Century China* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998).

⁹ Macabe Keliher, *The Board of Rites and the Making of Qing China* (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2019).

¹⁰ Standaert, 'Ritual Dances'.

¹¹ Standaert, 90.

¹² Lai Yu-chih 賴毓芝, 'Tu Yu Li. "Huangchao Liqi Tushi" de Chengli Yu Qi Yingxiang <「圖」與禮··《皇朝禮器圖式》的成立及其影響 [“Illustrations” and the Rites: The Formation of Illustrated Regulations for Ceremonial Paraphernalia of the Imperial Qing Dynasty and Its Influence]', *National Palace Museum Research Quarterly* 37, no. 2 (2020): 1–56.

understood simply as a top down, or central to local, diffusion of state-level ritual instruction. Compilers of local gazetteers such as the 1756 gazetteer for Xiangtan county in Hunan province sourced the visuals to accompany textual information about rituals from other compilations that circulated locally before those visuals appeared in the higher-level compilations about rituals such as *Huangchao liqi tushi* or *Qing Huidian tu* (1801).

In what follows, we will begin with an exploration of the category of ritual implements as they appear over time in text and image. This survey focuses on the so-called higher-level publications, often sponsored by the state and disseminated for use throughout the empire. The second section will discuss the earliest appearances of visual information about rituals and ritual implements in local gazetteers. The final section will offer a visual analysis, comparing the images of ritual implements in local gazetteers with the illustrations of ritual objects in other genres of text, to determine how the gazetteer images relate to imperially-endorsed ritual compilations and consider the transmission patterns of visual information about ritual implements in local gazetteers.

Ritual implements (禮器) in text and image

To understand this category of objects illustrated in local gazetteers, we need to briefly look back to earlier sources. Three classical texts from the Zhou dynasty (ca. 1046-256 BCE) form the base of all conversations on ritual in China: the Records of Ritual (*Liji* 禮記), the Rituals of Zhou (*Zhouli* 周禮) and the Etiquette and Ceremonies (*Yili* 儀禮). The terms *qi* 器 (vessel or insignia or instrument) and *li* 禮 (ritual, rite or propriety) are ubiquitous throughout those texts. From as early as the Eastern Zhou period (fifth to third century BCE), those terms also appear throughout the writings of the scholars associated with the school of Confucians, or

the so-called *Rujia* 儒家. Rituals and implements or vessels are inextricably connected, because, as Wu Hung states, drawing on the *Book of Rites*: ‘vessels store essential ritual codes’.¹³

The idea that vessels store essential ritual codes is stated ... plainly in the *Book of Rites*: “The round and square food containers *fu* 簠 and *gui* 簋, the stand *zu* 俎, and the tall dish *dou* 豆, with their regulated forms and decoration, are the vessels (*qi*) embodying ritual propriety (*li*)”.¹⁴

The oldest material records that testify to the importance of rituals date to the Three Dynasties (the Xia, the Shang and the Zhou, ca. 2100 BCE to 771 BCE), although recent archaeological excavations suggest that a ‘ritual system centering on social distinction and hierarchy’ already emerged in the millennium before 2000 BCE.¹⁵ During this time, society was ‘regulated by the codified ritual system known as *li*’.¹⁶ The vessels used as part of this ritual system varied widely in material, form, size and ornamentation, though the archaeological evidence clearly points to the prominence of bronze vessels during this time.¹⁷ Bronze-making technologies had advanced significantly, and the wide range of forms of bronzes in use suggests the increased complexity of society during this time.¹⁸ Vessels made of bronze, just as other implements made from jade, were considered especially

¹³ Wu Hung, ‘Practice and Discourse: Ritual Vessels in a Fourth-Century BCE Chinese Tomb’, in *Vessels: The Object as Container*, ed. Claudia Brittenham (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), 120.

¹⁴ Wu Hung, 120-121; Wu Hung quotes Ruan, 1980a, 1530 and Legge 1967, vol. 2, 100.

¹⁵ Archaeological excavations at the Taosi site in today’s Shanxi province yielded ‘sets of food vessels, wine vessels, musical vessels (instruments), and weapons’. Guo Wu, *An Anthropological Inquiry into Confucianism: Ritual, Emotion, and Rational Principle* (Lanham, Maryland: Lexington Books, 2022), 2.

¹⁶ Tao Wang, ‘Matter of Things: How to Read Ancient Chinese Bronzes’, in *Mirroring China’s Past: Emperors, Scholars, and Their Bronzes = Ji Jin Jian Gu / Tao Wang ; with Essays by Sarah Allan, Jeffrey Moser, Su Rongyu, Edward L. Shaughnessy, Zhixin Jason Sun, Zhou Ya, Liu Yu, and Lu Zhang.*, ed. Tao Wang (Chicago: The Art Institute of Chicago, 2018), 17.

¹⁷ Jessica Rawson, ‘Ornament in China’, in *A Companion to Chinese Art*, ed. Martin Powers and Katherine R. Tsiang (Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons Inc, 2015), 377.

¹⁸ Lothar von Falkenhausen, *Chinese Society in the Age of Confucius (1000-250 BC): The Archaeological Evidence* (ISD LLC, 2006).

suitable for use in ritual because of the combination of the aesthetic qualities, the rarity of the material and the amount of labour and craftsmanship required to work them they embodied.¹⁹ Archaeological excavations have yielded thousands of such ritual vessels and other implements, clearly distinct from objects used in domestic, secular settings.

Despite this archaeological record, it was not easy to identify exactly what the objects used in the performance of rituals in the five categories (*ji li* 吉禮 or auspicious sacrifices, *jia li* 嘉禮 or joyous rites, *jun li* 軍禮 or military rituals, *bin li* 賓禮 or guest ceremonies, and *xiong li* 兇禮 or funerary rituals) should look like. Thus, in the centuries that followed, scholars produced texts that sought to establish definitively how rituals should be performed, and what objects would have accompanied the performance of ritual during the Three Dynasties. In the second century AD, the later Han dynasty commentator on the Classics Zheng Xuan 鄭玄 (127-200) wrote his famous commentaries on the three classical texts on ritual. From then onwards, they were known collectively as the *San li* 三禮 and Zheng Xuan's commentary as the 'Commentaries on the Three Ritual Classics' (*Sanli zhu* 三禮注). Allegedly, Zheng Xuan also produced an illustrated version, known as the Illustrations to the Ritual Classics (*Sanli tu* 三禮圖), though this text is not extant.²⁰ During the Kaiyuan reign period (712-741) of the Tang dynasty (618-907), the 'Ritual Code of the Kaiyuan Period in the Great Tang' (*Da Tang Kaiyuan li* 開元禮) was published.²¹ It described the ca 150 separate rituals that formed the state ritual programme, drawn from Confucian

¹⁹ Jessica Rawson, *The British Museum Book of Chinese Art*, 2nd ed. (London: British museum Press, 2007), 44.

²⁰ This was alleged by Nie Chongyi, although this was already called into question during the reign of Song Taizu. See R.C. Pian, 'Nieh Ch'ung-i', in Herbert Franke, ed., *Sung Biographies* (Wiesbaden: Steiner, 1976), 801; François Louis, *Design by the Book: Chinese Ritual Objects and the Sanli Tu* (New York: Bard Graduate Center, 2016), 22n13. Louis refers to the 2011 study by Jiao Hui 喬輝 on Zheng Xuan's Sanli tu.

²¹ Xiao Song 蕭嵩 (d. 749), *Da Tang Kaiyuan li* 大唐開元禮 [*Ritual Code of the Kaiyuan Period in the Great Tang*] (732; repr., Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1978).

(rather than Buddhist or Daoist) textual sources such as the *Zhouli* and its commentary by Zheng Xuan.²² This ritual code came to be seen as the basis for all later ritual codes, and provided detail on the correct performance of state rituals in the aforementioned five ritual categories, thereby anchoring the state in the textual traditions associated with Confucian cosmology and legitimizing the political entity that authorized them.²³

None of these texts were illustrated. It was clear that vessels ‘embodied ritual propriety’ and ‘stored essential ritual codes’, but the lack of agreement over what such ritual implements should look like caused a certain amount of anxiety. Therefore, much scholarly enterprise was spent searching through texts, images and excavated objects for authoritative information on the correct size and shape of ritual implements, including visual representations of the ‘correct vessels’.

Zheng Xuan’s *Sanli tu* 三禮圖 is no longer extant, but Nie Chongyi 聶崇義 (fl. 948-964)’s version of *Sanli tu* is.²⁴ Nie was a specialist in the Classics and ‘Professor of the Imperial Sacrifices’ during the later Zhou dynasty (951–960).²⁵ He was also involved in the ‘casting of a new set of ceremonial vessels’ and the standardization of ‘ceremonial jades’ at the time of the establishment of the new Song dynasty (960-1279).²⁶ The illustrated text he offered in 961 to the first emperor of the Song dynasty, Taizu (r. 960-976 CE), proposed several new interpretations of the design and standard measurements of the ritual

²² David McMullen, ‘The Role of the Zhouli in Seventh- and Eighth-Century Civil Administrative Traditions’, in *Statecraft and Classical Learning: The Rituals of Zhou in East Asian History*, ed. Benjamin A. Elman and Martin Kern (Leiden: Brill, 2010), 217–20.

²³ Ming and Qing scholars quoted extensively from this text. Lam, ‘Musical Confucianism: The Case of “Jikong Yuewu”’, 142; See also Howard J Wechsler, *Offerings of Jade and Silk: Ritual and Symbol in the Legitimation of the T’ang Dynasty* (New Haven; London: Yale University Press, 1985).

²⁴ For a detailed discussion of the various extant editions that remain today, see Louis, *Design by the Book*, 128–30.

²⁵ For details, see the biography of Nie Chongyi by the ethno-musicologist Rulan Chao Pian. Franke, *Sung Biographies*, 801–2.

²⁶ Franke, 801.

implements, and thereby determined the fate of his text: it would remain associated with the ritual controversies that surrounded the founding of the Song empire.²⁷ According to recent studies of Nie's work, in the eleventh and twelfth centuries Nie's illustrations were dismissed as 'lacking classical foundation and .. an object of ridicule',²⁸ and as 'creative inventions with no scholarly basis'.²⁹

Nonetheless, Nie Chongyi's text was influential. Entitled 'Collected commentaries on the Illustrations to Three Ritual Classics' *Sanlitu jizhu* 三禮圖集注, Nie's illustrations were not his own invention: they were based on what he claimed were ten at the time extant illustrated versions that had been in circulation since the appearance of Zheng Xuan's comments and illustrations.³⁰ Nie's 20 *juan* text consists of 362 entries, which explain and illustrate the paraphernalia associated with ritual, including over forty vessels, the types of jades, musical instruments, as well as ritual clothing to be worn and the spaces used for ritual performances. During the reign of Song Taizu, the images of Nie's *Sanli tu* circulated throughout the empire in different ways. The images were painted, first on the walls of the Confucius Temple in the Directorate of Education, and then in 996 in the lecture hall of the State Academy (*guo xue* 國學) at the Directorate, so students could study the ritual texts and view the paintings as an aid to their readings. The images of *Sanli tu* were also distributed in printed form to Confucian schools in the provinces and prefectures, and it seems likely that in the decades that followed, *Sanli tu* images circulated through local schools both in printed form and by way of paintings on the walls of lecture halls.

²⁷ See the extensive discussion of these controversies in Louis, *Design by the Book*, 30–35.

²⁸ Hsu Ya-Hwei 許雅惠, 'Review of Design by the Book: Chinese Ritual Objects and the "Sanli Tu" by François Louis', *Journal of Song-Yuan Studies* 47, no. 1 (2017): 227.

²⁹ Louis, *Design by the Book*, 2.

³⁰ Nie Chongyi 聶崇義, *Sanli tu jizhu* 三禮圖集注 [Collected commentaries on the Illustrations to Three Ritual Classics], vol. 129, Yingyin Wenyuange Sikuquanshu (961; repr., Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983).

The status of the *Sanli tu* as an authoritative source for the design of ritual implements and disseminated in various ways beyond the court did not last. With the eleventh-century excavation of complete sets of bronze implements dating to the Shang (16th-11th century BCE) and Zhou (11th century-256 BCE) dynasties, and the shift in focus shifted towards what has become widely known as antiquarianism, Nie's *Sanli tu* came under renewed attack.³¹ Amidst extensive and factionalized debates at court and in private academies on ritual implements and music, revised illustrations of ritual implements began to circulate. In the twelfth century, starting in 1102, the last emperor of the Northern Song, Huizong 徽宗 (r. 1100-1126) initiated an extensive ritual reform programme.³² As a result, during the Zhenghe 政和 reign period (1111-1117) of Huizong's reign, the *Zhenghe wuli xinyi* 政和五禮新儀 ('New forms for the five rites from the Zhenghe reign period') was published, under the leadership of the ritual specialist Zheng Juzhong 鄭居中 (1059-1123). Described as 'the first official ritual compendium that seriously attempted to provide ritual procedures for commoners', the over 200 *juan* provided practical detail under headings such as 'capping ceremonies', 'guest rituals', and auspicious and inauspicious ceremonies (i.e. funerals).³³ This text, too, came under attack in later years, and a further revised handbook was subsequently published in the late twelfth century under the aegis of one of

³¹ Ya-hwei Hsu, 'Reshaping Chinese Material Culture: The Revival of Antiquity in the Era of Print, 960–1279' (Ph.D., Connecticut, Yale University, 2010); see also Robert E. Harrist, 'The Artist as Antiquarian: Li Gonglin and His Study of Early Chinese Art', *Artibus Asiae* 55, no. 3/4 (1995): 237–80.

³² Patricia Buckley Ebrey, *Emperor Huizong* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2014), 244–52; Ya-Hwei Hsu, 'Antiquities, Ritual Reform, and the Shaping of New Taste at Huizong's Court', *Artibus Asiae* 73, no. 1 (2013): 137–80; Joseph S.C. Lam, 'Huizong's Ritual and Musical Insignia', *Journal of Ritual Studies* 19, no. 1 (2005): 1–18.

³³ Liu Yonghua, *Confucian Rituals and Chinese Villagers: Ritual Change and Social Transformation in a Southeastern Chinese Community, 1368-1949* (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 5.

Nie's most vocal critics: Zhu Xi (1130-1200), entitled *Shaoxi zhouxian shidianshi tu* 紹熙州縣釋奠儀圖 ('Shaoxi Illustrated Handbook for Worshipping Confucius in the Provinces').³⁴

Over the centuries that followed, revised ritual codes were published with a certain regularity, all of them elucidating the topic of state ritual regulations through illustrations. During the Ming dynasty, new editions of extant works appeared, as was the case for *Sanli tu*, but important new compilations also appeared, such as *Da Ming huidian* 大明會典 (Collected Statutes of the Great Ming).³⁵ *Da Ming huidian* was produced under the auspices of the Directorate of Ceremonial (*Silijian* 司禮監), the most prestigious and powerful of the eunuch-run Directorates. Published under the name of the high official Li Dongyang (1447-1516), it had a preface dated to 1509. The original 180 *juan* of *Da Ming huidian* were subsequently revised and expanded to 228 *juan* by Grand Secretary Shen Shixing (1535-1614) in Wanli 15 (1587) (Figure 3).³⁶ This definitive edition brought together the information from several ritual compilations dated to the early decades of the Ming, such as the *Da Ming jili* 大明集禮 ('Collected rituals of the Great Ming'), first compiled during the Hongwu reign period in 1369-1370 by Xu Yikui 徐一夔 (1315-1400), with detailed instructions about music and ritual dance. It also drew on the *Hongwu lizhi* 洪武禮制 ('The ritual system of the Hongwu reign period'), and the *Liyi dingshi* 禮儀定式 ('Regulations for rituals and ceremonies'), dated 1387 and reprinted in 1545.³⁷ *Da Ming huidian* went on to

³⁴ Louis, *Design by the Book*, 83; Hsu Ya-Hwei 許雅惠, 'Review of Design by the Book', 230.

³⁵ Liu Ji 劉績 (jinshi 1490), ed., *San li tu* 三禮圖 (Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983).

³⁶ Leiden University has a copy of the Zhengde edition. Li Dongyang 李東陽, ed., *Da Ming hui dian* 大明會典 (Beijing: Silijian 司禮監 [Directorate of Ceremonial], 1509); Li Dongyang 李東陽 and Shen Shixing 申時行, eds., *Da Ming huidian*, National Library of China -- Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese rare book digitization project (Beijing: Neifu kanben, 1587).

³⁷ Jérôme Kerlouégan, 'Printing for Prestige? Publishing and Publications by Ming Princes (Part 3)', *East Asian Publishing and Society* 2, no. 1 (2012): 16.

provide 'knowledge about state structure and the duties and responsibilities of each board in the Ming government' into the Qing dynasty.³⁸

The 1587 edition of *Ming Huidian* offers a rich set of illustrations of all aspects of rituals, with details on the hats, robes and rank insignia (*juan* 60-61), the full set of musical instruments to be used in ritual performance (*juan* 81), and the lay-out to be used for setting out the implements and performing the ritual (*juan* 84-85).³⁹ These illustrations were quite distinct from those included in *Sanli tu*. The Ming edition of *Sanli tu*, produced by Liu Ji 劉績 (jinshi 1490) included simple drawings, offering schematic views of objects and pieces of clothing, while the illustrations in the Wanli edition of the *Huidian* are more elaborate and detailed. More importantly, many of the objects that are illustrated in *Sanli tu*, such as the ceremonial attire, the consort attire, the pitch pots and archery targets, the different types of bows and arrows, the flags and banners, the sacrificial jades, the wine utensils, the food offering utensils, the offering vessels for ancestral worship and burial equipment are all not illustrated in *Da Ming huidian*.

In terms of ritual, the Qing system was largely based on its Ming precedent.⁴⁰ The Qing compilations related to ritual implements that were published in the late seventeenth and into the eighteenth century drew in part on Ming ritual manuals, but also brought in significant new information, including objects and materials that had been collected (or better: looted) during Central Asian conquests.⁴¹ Wu Hung refers to the eighteenth-century

³⁸ Keliher, *The Board of Rites and the Making of Qing China*, 223n39; see also Zujie Yuan, 'Dressing for Power: Rite, Costume, and State Authority in Ming Dynasty China', *Frontiers of History in China* 2, no. 2 (2007): 181–212.

³⁹ Shen Shixing 申時行, ed., *Ming hui dian 明會典*, Guoxue jiben congshu (1587; repr., Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1968).

⁴⁰ Richard J. Smith, *Mapping China and Managing the World: Culture, Cartography and Cosmology in Late Imperial Times* (New York: Routledge, 2013), 91.

⁴¹ Yu Hui-chun 余慧君, 'Bronzes from Afar Ch'ien-Lung's Hsi-Ch'ing Hsü-Chien Chia-Pien Fu-Lu', *Guoli Taiwan Daxue Meishu Shi Yanjiu Jikan 國立臺灣大學美術史研究集刊* 31 (2011): 151–204.

efforts of the Qianlong emperor as ‘the most ambitious project ever attempted to bring old and new materials into a contemporary ritual system’.⁴² The 50 juan *Qinding Da Qing tongli* (欽定) 大清通禮 (Imperially endorsed General rituals of the Great Qing), compiled between 1736 and 1757, was the first outcome of this project.⁴³ In it, the Qianlong emperor hints at his own ambitions when he describes the purpose of the Sage Kings of the Three Dynasties in their regulation of ritual in accordance with people’s sentiment, and their creation of ceremony on the basis of human nature, stating: ‘They could therefore unify the land within the seas and synchronize the population, and could prevent transgressions and rescue the country from decline.’⁴⁴ *Da Qing tongli* includes specific detail on the size of the implements and their placement during the ritual but does not illustrate their appearance.⁴⁵

New editions of the Collected Statutes also reveal this ambition of the Qianlong emperor to confirm a comprehensive ritual system. The first (Kangxi) edition of the *Da Qing huidian* 大清會典 (Collected Statutes of the Great Qing) had appeared in 1690, with further editions appearing during the reigns of the Yongzheng, Qianlong, Jiaqing and Guangxu emperors. The full title of the Jiaqing version is (*Qinding*) *Da Qing huidian tu* (欽定) 大清會典圖 (‘Imperially endorsed illustrated Collected Statutes of the Great Qing) in 132 juan, the first illustrated version of the Qing Collected Statutes (Figure 4).⁴⁶ It has full details and

⁴² Wu Hung, ‘The Art of “Ritual Artifacts”’, 249; on the integration of new (old) objects into existing ritual systems, see Yu Huichun, ‘Qianlong’s Divine Treasures: The Bells in Rhyming-the-Old Hall’, *Asia Major* 22, no. 2 (2009): 121–44.

⁴³ Lai Bao 來保, ed., *Qinding Da Qing tongli* 欽定大清通禮 (1756; repr., Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983) an expanded second edition of this text, with four new chapters, appeared in 1824; for an annotated translation of sections of this text, see Zito, *Of Body and Brush*.

⁴⁴ Wu Hung, ‘The Art of “Ritual Artifacts”’, 250. Wu Hung quotes *Da Qing tongli*: 413.

⁴⁵ Macabe Keliher, ‘Administrative Law and the Making of the First *Da Qing Huidian*’, *Late Imperial China* 37, no. 1 (2016): 55.

⁴⁶ The Guangxu edition also has images. Chinaknowledge.de states the following: ‘Because the version from the Guangxu reign is the most up-to-date version, it attracted much more attention than the earlier versions from the Kangxi, Yongzheng 雍正 (1723-1735), Qianlong and Jiaqing reign-periods. All modern reprints of the canon accordingly made use of the Guangxu edition. The latest edition, published by the Xianzhuang Shuju 綫

illustrations on all ritual vessels and musical implements, as well as military banners, guns, canons and astronomical clocks.

Most noteworthy for the study of Qing-era illustrations of ritual implements is perhaps the completion in 1759 of the 'Illustrated Regulations for Ceremonial Paraphernalia of the Imperial Qing Dynasty' (*Huangchao liqi tushi* 皇朝禮器圖式) in 18 *juan*.⁴⁷ With 1,300 illustrated entries, this, arguably, was the culmination of the ritual reform efforts undertaken during Qianlong's reign.⁴⁸ The 'Illustrated Regulations' comprise six separate sections of several *juan* each, covering the following topics: implements for sacrifice (*jiqi* 祭器); implements for ceremonies (*yiqi* 儀器), caps and robes (*guanfu* 冠服), musical instruments (*yueqi* 樂器),⁴⁹ insignia (*lubu* 鹵簿), and military implements (*wubei* 武備). Each individual item is provided with an illustration; in the original 1759 version produced at the imperial court, these were colour illustrations (Figure 5). A second, monochrome version was produced with woodblock engravings in 1766, which is the version that was included in the *Siku quanshu* and circulated widely (Figure 6).⁵⁰ Each illustration is accompanied by a

裝書局 as Da-Qing wuchao huidian 大清五朝會典, includes the versions Da-Qing huidian from the Kangxi and Yongzheng reign-period, the (Qinding) Da-qing hudian (欽定)大清會典 from the Kangxi, Yongzheng and Guangxu reign-periods, the Da-Qing hudian tu 欽定大清會典圖 from the Jiaqing and Guangxu reign-periods, but not the (Qinding) Da-Qing huidian zeli (欽定)大清會典則例 from the Qianlong and the Da-Qing huidian shili 欽定大清會典事例 from the Jiaqing and Guangxu reign-periods. This is quite lamentable, as important sources are missing in the complete collection'.

<http://www.chinaknowledge.de/Literature/Historiography/qinghuidian.html> Consulted 8 March 2021.

⁴⁷ Yunlu 允祿 and Fulong'an 福隆安, eds., *Huangchao liqi tushi* 皇朝禮器圖式 [Illustrated Regulations for Ceremonial Paraphernalia of the Qing Dynasty] (1759; repr., Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983). Copies of the manuscript are held at the Palace Museum in Beijing and the National Museum of China. Album leaves of a manuscript copy of this text with coloured illustrations are scattered over several libraries, including the Victoria & Albert Museum, the National Museum of Scotland, the National Museum of Ireland, the Mactaggart Collection of the University of Alberta Museums and the British Library. 'Huangchao Liqi Tushi 皇朝禮器圖式' (Qianlong), British Library, OR 9430; for analysis of the provenance of these scattered album leaves, see Haoyang Zhao, 'Art Historical and Provenance Research in a Case Study of Huangchao Liqi Tushi', *Journal for Art Market Studies* 4, no. 2 (2020).

⁴⁸ Lai Yu-chih 賴毓芝, 'Tu Yu Li'.

⁴⁹ Zhang Ke 张珂, 'Huangchao Liqi Tushi Zhong de Yueqi 《皇朝礼器图式》中的乐器', *Gehai*, no. 05 (2016): 38–42.

⁵⁰ Zhao, 'Art Historical and Provenance Research'.

description of its appearance, its size, the materials of which it is made, decorations, and the ways in which the implement is to be used. The compilation even includes 50 optical and astronomical instruments and time pieces that originated in Europe, such as the Western clock (Figure 7). The instruments reflect the interest in Western science of the Qing emperors, while the clock, which was positioned next to the imperial throne symbolized the emperor's 'timely performance of his ceremonial duties' through which he could 'figuratively rule the world'.⁵¹

It is clear, then, that the category of ritual implements includes a wide range of objects. They all relate to the performance of ritual, but in different ways, and over the centuries no agreement seems to have been reached about which implements should be used, what such implements should look like, what materials they were made from, what size and shape they had, and so on. Consecutive emperors and their scholarly advisers concerned themselves with this category of objects and produced texts to confirm their concerns, but none of them succeeded in establishing a definitive set of images that could stand the test of time. The idea of what ritual implements were and should look like continued to change throughout the dynasties. It is also clear that these ideas about ritual implements concerned the court, and the performance of ritual at the level of the state as a whole. This, then brings us back to the question of the appearance of ritual implements in the genre of local gazetteers, to which we will turn in the following sections.

Images of ritual implements in local gazetteers: when and where

⁵¹ Wu Hung, 'The Art of "Ritual Artifacts"', 250.

The first edition of the county gazetteer for Xinchang 新昌 county may be the first extant local gazetteer with illustrations of ritual implements.⁵² Dating to the Chenghua reign period (1477), this edition only exists in manuscript copy in Nanjing.⁵³ The first *juan* is entitled *tuxiang* 圖像 ('illustrations and portraits'). One or two maps are followed by depictions of the offices and school buildings, and then an image of ritual implements follows (Figure 8a). The Jiaging (1521) edition, which has recently been added to the Airusheng dataset, includes this same set of images (Figure 8b).⁵⁴ Also included in this *juan* are schematic depictions of the layout for rituals, landscape illustrations of the village, and a series of twenty official portraits. The ritual implements are not represented in much detail, and the accompanying text is difficult to read, but the standard shapes are all easily recognizable.⁵⁵ Interestingly, none of the later Ming and Qing gazetteers for this county include any visual depictions of ritual implements.⁵⁶ The ongoing relevance of the Ming images becomes clear in a comparison with the Republican-era edition of the gazetteer (Figure 9). Instead of including the ritual implements in the *tuxiang* 圖像 (illustrations and portraits) section, as was the case in the Chenghua and Jiaging editions, the Republican-era edition creates a new section

⁵² This gazetteer is the subject of extensive discussion in chapter 2 of Joseph Dennis, *Writing, Publishing, and Reading Local Gazetteers in Imperial China, 1100-1700* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center: Distributed by Harvard University Press, 2015), 70–114.

⁵³ The manuscript copy, dated 1477, is held in the Nanjing Zhongguo kexueyuan dili yanjiusuo 南京中国科学院地理研究所. Dennis, 349.

⁵⁴ Mo Dan 莫旦, ed., (*Jiaging*) *Xinchang xianzhi* 新昌縣志 (16 *juan*), 1521 The Airusheng set also includes the Wanli (1579), Qianlong (1793), Tongzhi (1872) and Minguo (1919) editions of this gazetteer. LoGaRT does not quite match that list: it includes a Kangxi (shanben) edition (1671) from the Harvard digitization project, but it does not have the Jiaging edition.

⁵⁵ Mo Dan 莫旦, *juan* 1.

⁵⁶ Tian Guan 田瑄, ed., (*Wanli*) *Xinchang xianzhi* (萬曆)新昌縣志 (13 *juan*) (1579; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2009); Lü Zengnan 呂曾柎 and Liu Zuoliang 劉作樑, eds., (*Kangxi*) *Xinchang Xianzhi* 新昌縣志 (18 *juan*), Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project- Shanben fangzhi, 1671; Wan Tinglan 萬廷蘭 and Yang Wenfeng 楊文峰, eds., (*Qianlong*) *Xinchang xianzhi* (乾隆)新昌縣志 (25 *juan*) (1793; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2013); Zhu Qing'e 朱慶萼, ed., (*Tongzhi*) *Xinchang xianzhi* (同治)新昌縣志 (32 *juan*) (1872; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2013); Jin Cheng 金城 and Chen Yu 陳畚, eds., (*Minguo*) *Xinchang xianzhi* 新昌縣志 (20 *juan*), *Zhongguo fangzhi congshu* (1919; repr., Taipei: Chengwen chubanshe, 1970).

entitled *tuhua* 圖畫 ('pictures').⁵⁷ The sequence of the implements is also not quite the same, but a close comparison of individual items of the Chenghua and Minguo editions confirms that the selected shapes and text are largely the same. To illustrate the similarity of the Chenghua and Minguo editions, Table 1 features a selection of objects from these two editions, and contrasts these with the shape and design of the same ritual objects chosen from a very different gazetteer. The contrasting images in the third column are entirely unrelated to the images in the first two columns; they simply serve to highlight the closeness of the Xinchang gazetteer images and the contrast with the Xiangtan images. The juxtaposition reveals that the Minguo gazetteer editors took the images from the Chenghua gazetteer as their source, and re-carved blocks to approximate the original images.⁵⁸

Before we return to the Qing-era Xiangtan gazetteer we opened the discussion with, it is worth noting that the Ming gazetteers are poorly represented amongst the gazetteers included in the LoGaRT tool with illustrations of ritual vessels. Only two Ming dynasty gazetteers have such illustrations. The first of these is the Jiajing-era *Guangdong tongzhi chugao* 廣東通志初稿 (1535).⁵⁹ The five images related to ritual are not illustrating the objects per se, but offer schematic representations or maps for the set-up for five separate rituals: capping ceremonies, marriage ritual, funerary rites, sacrifices, and archery rituals 射禮. Objects are included, but only in very small form, and for the purpose of illustrating their placement, not their size or form (Figure 10). The marriage ritual map includes no objects,

⁵⁷ Jin Cheng 金城 and Chen Yu 陳畚, (*Minguo*) *Xinchang xianzhi*, *tuhua* (n.p.).

⁵⁸ The text reads: 宋淳祐元年知縣丁璣刻石立於講堂并刻牲圖同. (In the first year of the Chunyou reign period of the (Southern) Song dynasty (i.e. 1241), the county magistrate, Ding Shu, had [these] carved in stone and erected it in the lecture hall. He additionally carved the images of the sacrificial animals and [did] the same there.)

⁵⁹ Dai Jing 戴璟 and Zhang Yue 張岳, eds., (*Jiajing*) *Guangdong tong zhi chu gao* (嘉靖) 廣東通志初稿, Beijing tushuguan guji zhenben congkan (1535; repr., Beijing: Shu mu wen xian chu ban she, 1988).

and the maps for the funerary rituals and for sacrifices again only very small images of objects. A variety of ritual implements is included in the lay-out for the archery ritual (Figure 11), though the quality of the image makes it hard to see the details. There are musical instruments and vessels, bows, arrows and stands, demonstrating who stands where and does what. The other Ming gazetteer with images depicting ritual dates from the end of the sixteenth century offers the exact opposite of this 1535 gazetteer. This is the Jiajing edition of the Sichuan provincial gazetteer, entitled *Sichuan zongzhi* 四川總志, which includes detailed illustrations of eight large vessels (Figures 12 & 13).⁶⁰ Oddly, the Wanli edition of the same gazetteer does not include these images.⁶¹ The eight vessels of the Jiajing edition stand out for several reasons: they cover a full page (recto and verso), while most illustrations of objects in the gazetteer fit on half of the page (recto or verso), and the ornament on the surface of the vessels is provided in great detail. Surprisingly, there is no accompanying text, no description of the object, no name, and no detail in terms of size, shape, material and use. In both cases, then, we are dealing with representations of implements dating to the Ming that are exceptional or deviate from the usual pattern.

If during the Ming few gazetteers included visual information about ritual, during the Qing dynasty, this changes dramatically. A total number of 164 separate gazetteer titles includes 1,717 separate images depicting an aspect of the performance of ritual. As some of these separate gazetteer titles encompass more than one edition, the overall total number of gazetteers is even larger. As Figure 14 shows, there is a vast difference between the reign periods of the Qing in terms of the appearance of images associated with rituals in local

⁶⁰ Liu Damo 劉大謨 and Yang Shen 楊慎, eds., (*Jiajing*) *Sichuan zongzhi* (嘉靖) 四川總志 (1566; repr., Beijing: Shumu wenxian chubanshe, 1988).

⁶¹ Guo Fei 郭棐 and Yu Huaizhong 虞懷忠, eds., (*Wanli*) *Sichuan zongzhi* (萬曆) 四川總志 (34 juan), Zhongguo fangzhiku (Wanli; repr., Beijing: Beijing Airusheng shuzihua jishu yanjiu zhongxin, 2009).

gazetteers. It is an oddly fluctuating publication pattern. The single image related to ritual that was published during the Shunzhi reign period (1643-1661), does not concern an object; it is a schematic representation of the lay-out of the village drinking ritual (*xiang yin zhi tu* 鄉飲之圖).⁶² In contrast, during Kangxi (1661-1722), a total of 150 pages with image related to ritual appeared. During Yongzhen (1722-1735), only 48 images were published, while the Qianlong reign period (1735-1796) saw the appearance of 313 images; Jiaqing (1796-1820) 84, Daoguang (1820-1850) 93, Xianfeng (1850-1861) 77, Tongzhi (1861-1875) 494, Guangxu (1875-1908) 453, and finally, during Xuantong (1908-1912), 4. Four reign periods clearly stand out: Kangxi (150), Qianlong (313), Tongzhi (494) and Guangxu (453). These four reign periods, with 1,410 images all together, make up 82% of all the pages with images related to ritual dated to the Qing period.

During the Kangxi reign period, 25 gazetteers were published with visual materials concerning rituals. More than half of these only include one or two images, while four out of 25 gazetteers are responsible for 91 of the 150 images (or 60%). These four Kangxi gazetteers are the Yunmeng county gazetteer 雲夢縣志 of 1668,⁶³ the Hanyang prefectural gazetteer 漢陽府志 of 1669,⁶⁴ the Baoqing prefectural gazetteer 寶慶府志 of 1684,⁶⁵ and the Dongye 東野誌 (in Shandong) gazetteer of 1689.⁶⁶ It is worth looking at this last

⁶² Mei Yantao 梅彥騫 and Li Baozhen 李葆貞, eds., (*Shunzhi*) *Pucheng xianzhi* (順治)浦城縣志 (1651; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2009); This ritual was performed to confirm the ritual distinction between elder and younger community residents. Richard J. Smith, 'Ritual in Ch'ing Culture', in *Orthodoxy in Late Imperial China*, ed. Kwang-Ching Liu (Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 1991), 281–310.

⁶³ Zhang Kuihua 張奎華, *Yunmeng xian zhi* 雲夢縣志, ed. Chen Mengzhou 陳夢舟 (1668; repr., Beijing: Xianzhuang shuju, 2001).

⁶⁴ Li Ningzhong 李寧仲 and Chen Guoru 陳國儒, eds., (*Kangxi*) *Hanyang Fu zhi* (康熙)漢陽府志, *Zhongguo fang zhi ku* (1669; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2013).

⁶⁵ Liang Bihai 梁碧海 and Liu Yingqi 劉應祁, eds., (*Kangxi*) *Baoqing Fu zhi* 寶慶府志 (1684; repr., Beijing: Shumu wenxian chubanshe, 1988).

⁶⁶ Lü Huashun 呂化舜, Kong Yanfa 孔衍法, and Kong Yanzhi 孔衍治, eds., *Dongye zhi* 東野誌, National Library of China -- Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese rare book digitization project, 1689.

publication in greater detail, because of these four Kangxi publications, this gazetteer is the only publication with illustration of ritual implements. The others have images related to rituals, such as the schematic lay-out of the ritual space and the dance moves, but no implements. The Kangxi edition of the Dongye gazetteer, however, includes this set of images of 30 individual ritual objects (Figure 15).⁶⁷ The notes underneath the illustrations generally provide detail on weight, height, depth, width and diameter. Further detail on the performance of ritual in Dongye is provided, but not illustrated.

The next significant increase occurs during the Qianlong reign period. During this period, 52 separate gazetteers with images of ritual-related content were published. Again, not all of these have extensive sets of images; 43 of 52 (or 82%) of those gazetteers have fewer than 10 images, and 43% only one single image. But if we focus again on the four gazetteers with the greatest number of images, that set includes the Xiangtan gazetteer of 1756 that we opened this piece with, which has 63 pages with images related to ritual, as well as the Guangzhou gazetteer 光州志 of 1762 (20 pages with images), the Jiahe county gazetteer 嘉禾縣志 published in 1766 (27 pages with images), and the Panyu county gazetteer 番禺縣志 of 1774 (23 pages with images). To contrast the Xiangtan set, with its very extensive set of images, with the Kangxi-era Dongye gazetteer set, with its far smaller set (Figure 15) and to provide a sense of the sheer quantity of images, an overview image of the Xiangtan images is included (Figure 16). Comparing these two figures reveals that while the Dongye gazetteer has an extensive set of objects, much of what is not included amongst the illustrations in the Dongye set, such as musical instruments, robes and the full

⁶⁷ Lü Huashun 呂化舜, Kong Yanfa 孔衍法, and Kong Yanzhi 孔衍治, juan 1.

complement of dance moves is illustrated in the Qianlong-era Xiangtan gazetteer.⁶⁸ The exceptional nature of the Xiangtan gazetteer becomes more manifest through such comparison. Before we return to the question of the sources for these images and the motivations behind their inclusion in local gazetteers, a brief investigation of the location of these publications.

Qing gazetteers with images related to ritual appear scattered all over the empire (Map 1). However, when we zoom in more closely, it becomes clear that, in fact, a single province hosts most of the gazetteers with images related to ritual: Hunan province. Of the 1,717 pages with images appearing in Qing gazetteers, over one third (636, or 37%) appeared in Hunan province alone. Moreover, well over half (58%) of the total number of pages with images originated in only three provinces: Hunan, Jiangxi and Hebei. Why Hunan, specifically? This is not a function of gazetteer production in general: less than 6% of all gazetteers published during the Qing related to Hunan. It is, in part, a function of Hunan's general prowess in producing gazetteers with images: of all 55,420 pages with images in Qing gazetteers included in the LoGaRT system, just over 10% stem from Hunan; more images were produced in Hunan than in any other single province. But if 10% of all Qing gazetteer images stem from Hunan, and 37% of all images related to ritual stem from Hunan, then there is a significant concentration of images of ritual produced in Hunan (Figure 17 & 18), spread fairly evenly over the counties of Hunan. The Xiangtan county gazetteer, with its extensive set of images of ritual implements, then, fits into this wider context of a practice that was reasonably widespread through Hunan during the reign periods of the Kangxi, Yongzheng and Qianlong emperors.

⁶⁸ For extensive discussion of the sources of these images, their annotations and the circulation history of these images, see Standaert, 'Ritual Dances'.

Like most gazetteers, the Xiangtan county gazetteer of the mid-eighteenth century included a list of Confucian (or orthodox) rituals to be performed in the area, as well as extensive lists of religious sites such as shrines, monasteries and temples. In fact, the ritual system of Xiangtan county, as it is presented in the gazetteer, is organised around religious spaces. *Juan* 8 of the 1756 edition, which contains the discussion of the county's institutions of learning (學校志), begins with a listing of the sites used for religious performances, and provides brief indications of major changes that took place within the organization of ritual space. For the main hall of the Confucian temple, the gazetteer adds that from the 9th year of Jiajing (1530), this space was no longer allowed to be called a hall (*dian* 殿) but should be called a temple (*miao* 廟); that several four-character imperial inscriptions were received during the reigns of Kangxi, Yongzheng and Qianlong, for display in the spaces; that the bells and drums were kept in the east and west wings of the main hall, and that the ritual implements and musical instruments were kept on the left and right sides of the main hall.⁶⁹ Detailed information about the implementation of changes that follow central government commands are included in the descriptions of all the ritual institutions that fall under the broad heading of institutions of learning in Xiangtan, suggesting a close integration between central orders and local implementation in terms of ritual. The description of the storage spaces used for drums, bells, and other ritual and musical implements also suggests that these objects were actually held and used for the performance of ritual in the county, not merely stated as (unattainable) ideals. Some of the rituals performed at the local level were more or less direct copies of the rituals performed at state level, such as the sacrifice to Confucius (*jikong*); other rituals, especially from the Ming dynasty onwards, were intended

⁶⁹ Ouyang Zhenghuan 歐陽正煥 and Lü Zhengyin 呂正音, *Xiangtan xianzhi*, 8.2a-4b.

specifically for local performance, such as the community libation ceremony (*xiang yinjiu li* 鄉飲酒禮) and the rituals performed at the altars of soil and grain (*shejitan* 社稷壇).⁷⁰ In Qing Xiangtan, rituals were performed not only at empire-wide prescribed cults such as the altar for soil and grain, the altar for hungry ghosts (*litan* 厲壇) and the Confucius temple (*wenmiao* 文廟) but also various altars for Song dynasty scholars and worthies and locally revered figures with a specific link to Hunan.⁷¹

Instructions for the performance of state rituals were not just relevant for the imperial court but also needed to be cascaded down to the lower administrative levels and disseminated to those responsible for the performance of rituals at the provincial, prefectural and county level. During the Ming dynasty, these instructions seem on the whole have remained limited to textual instructions, or to schematic illustrations with indications of the placement of specific objects, without detailed illustrations of individual objects. During the Qing, however, such illustrations began to appear in significant numbers, especially during the reign periods in which ritual was considered significant, both at the imperial level, such as during the reign of the Qianlong and Guangxu emperors, and at the local level, especially, as we have seen in Hunan.

Images of ritual implements compared: the tiger and his teeth

It is clear from the above that gazetteers belong amongst the genres of text that provide information about what ritual implements should look like. This, of course, raises further

⁷⁰ Liu Yonghua, *Confucian Rituals and Chinese Villagers*, 6; Peter K. Bol, *Neo-Confucianism in History* (Boston: Harvard University Asia Center, 2008), 259.

⁷¹ Chen Jiayu 陳嘉榆 and Wang Kaiyun 王闔運, eds., (*Guangxu*) *Xiangtan xian zhi* 光緒湘潭縣志 [(*Guangxu*) *Xiangtan county gazetteer*, Xuxiu Siku quanshu (1889; repr., Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 2002), 7.1a-8b.

questions. What does the genre of local gazetteers have to do with these illustrated ritual guidelines? Why are images published in gazetteers and how do those gazetteer images relate to the type of texts outlined in this survey? For whom was this information intended, and why? And where did the Qing gazetteer compilers find the necessary information for producing these gazetteer images? To answer such questions, I focus on a smaller subset of images related to ritual: the depictions of musical instruments, and specifically on the so-called stopper: the tiger-shaped wooden instrument with teeth running along the back of the tiger. Music, and musical instruments such as the stopper, played a key role in state rituals at court.

As Joseph Lam and others have shown, instructions for performing music and dance at ritual occasions had begun to be mandated in the early Ming by Zhu Yuanzhang, but it was not until the late Ming that such musical performances really began to flourish. Numerous publications were produced to offer guidance for the correct performance of music at the Ming court.⁷² These included the ‘Illustrated manual of Confucian rites and music’ (*Dacheng yuewu tupu* 大成樂舞圖譜) by Zhang E 張鶚,⁷³ and the 1609 treatise on ritual music by Qu Jiusi 瞿九思 (1546-1617), entitled ‘Study of the rites and music of the Confucius Temple’ (*Kongmiao liyue kao* 孔廟禮樂考), which has no illustrations.⁷⁴ Ming publications on music also included the Wanli era ‘Records on the rites and music of the Confucian Temple’ (*Wenmiao liyue zhi* 文廟禮樂志) by Pan Luan 潘巒 and the ‘Study of

⁷² Lam, *State Sacrifices and Music in Ming China*; Lam, ‘Musical Confucianism: The Case of “Jikong Yuewu”’; Ben Wu, ‘Ritual Music in the Court and Rulership of the Qing Dynasty (1644-1911)’ (PhD, Pittsburgh, University of Pittsburgh, 1998); Joseph S. C. Lam, ‘Music and Masculinities in Late Ming China’, *Asian Music* 42, no. 2 (2011): 112–34.

⁷³ This volume, with a 1520 preface, is only available in the Naikaku bunko in Japan. Lam, *State Sacrifices and Music in Ming China*, 78.

⁷⁴ Qu Jiusi 瞿九思, *Kongmiao liyue kao* 孔廟禮樂考, Xuxiu Sikuquanshu (1609; repr., Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 2002).

sacrificial rites by early masters' (*Xianshi jidian kao* 先師祀典考) by Ma Po 馬朴, but these are all better known through references integrated into the better-known 'Collection of documents on the Confucian rites and music' (*Dacheng liyue ji* 大成禮樂集) by Shi Jishi 史記事.⁷⁵ The latter includes illustrations of the schematic lay-out of the instruments, of the suspended bells and chime stones, the zithers and flutes, as well as the starter and the stopper (Figure 19).⁷⁶

During the early reign periods of the Qing dynasty, too, materials specific to the performance of music were published. This included, for example, the 'Complete Description of the Rites and Music for the Ceremonials [Offered to Confucius] in Local Schools' (*Pangong liyue quanshu* 類宮禮樂全書), which appeared in 1656.⁷⁷ The *Lülü Zhengyi* 律呂正義, a short work (5 *juan*) on the correct use of the pitch pipes (*lülü* 律呂) was compiled between 1713 and 1722, under the auspices of the Kangxi emperor. It was printed in 1724, after Kangxi's death by the Yongzheng emperor, with volumes on astronomy and mathematics, which included information provided by the Jesuits at Kangxi's court.⁷⁸ The second of the three sections of *Lülü Zhengyi* provided an overview of the eight categories of musical instruments. These categories were material categories, so they distinguished metal, stone, silk, bamboo, gourd, earth, leather (or hide), and wood. Then

⁷⁵ Lam, 'Music and Masculinities in Late Ming China'; Wang Zhou 王州 and Wang Yaohua 王耀华, 'Kongmiao Liyue de Dingwei, Shijian Ji Qi Wenhua Neihan: Yi Mingdai Wenxian 《Kongmiao Liyue Kao》《Dacheng Liyue Ji》 kaocha Wei Zhongxin 孔庙礼乐的定位、实践及其文化内涵——以明代文献《孔庙礼乐考》《大成礼乐集》考察为中心', *Zhongguo Yinyue Xue*, no. 1 (2017): 37–41.

⁷⁶ Shi Jishi 史記事, *Da Cheng Li Yue Ji* 大成禮樂集, 1622, *juan* 2-3-4. No illustrations are found in *juan* 1 and 5.

⁷⁷ Zhang Anmao 張安茂, *Pangong liyue quanshu* 類宮禮樂全書 [Complete Description of the Rites and Music for the Ceremonials [Offered to Confucius] in Local Schools], *Siku quanshu cunmu congshu* (1656; repr., Jinan: Qi Lu shushe chubanshe, 1997); the Qing publication largely follows its Ming precedent: Li Zhizhao 李之藻, *Pangong liyue shu* 類宮禮樂疏 [Manual on rites and music at county and prefectural schools] (1618; repr., Taipei: Guoli zhongyang tushuguan, 1970); see also Standaert, 'Ritual Dances', 96.

⁷⁸ *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi* 御製律呂正義 [Imperially improved standard interpretation of music theory], Yingyin Wenyuange *Sikuquanshu* (1724; repr., Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983).

followed an introduction to the 14 main types of instrument used: the pan pipes (*paixiao*), vertical bamboo flute (*xiao*), transverse bamboo flute (*di*), the mouth organ (*sheng*), the cylindrical double-reed pipe (*touguan*), the transverse bamboo flute (*chi*), the egg-shaped flute (*xun*), the zithers (seven-stringed *qin* and 25-stringed *se*), the bells (*zhong*), chime stones (*qing*), drums (*gu*), and the starter (*zhu*) and stopper (*yu*).⁷⁹ This text was extended during the eighteenth century, when a volume entitled *Yuzhi Lülü Zhengyi houbian* (Sequel to the Imperially approved standard interpretation of music theory) was published in 1746. In this version, the text was reorganised, and extended with sections on other musical instruments (*yueqi* 樂器) and on pieces of music (*yuezhang* 樂章). The text went from 5 *juan* to 120 *juan* and became an important reference work for discussions on ritual at the imperial court.⁸⁰

Throughout the nineteenth century, even whilst the empire faced severe threats from many different directions, scholars continued to produce illustrated publications, on music specifically, but also on the importance of ritual in general. The scholar-official Lin Changyi 林昌彝 (1803-1876), for example, male relative of the even more famous Lin Zexu 林則徐, published not only descriptions of his experiences of the Opium War, but also a volume entitled 'General commentaries on the Three Rites' (*Sanli tongshi* 三禮通釋), which included illustrations of musical instruments (Figure 20).⁸¹ The correct performance of ritual was important, at court and throughout the empire. And thus, music, musical instruments and the choreography of movement also featured in the guidelines for the performance of rituals at the level of prefectures and counties. More than static objects like sacrificial

⁷⁹ Wu, 'Ritual Music in the Court and Rulership of the Qing Dynasty (1644-1911)', 33–34.

⁸⁰ Standaert, 'Ritual Dances'.

⁸¹ Lin Changyi 林昌彝, *Sanli tongshi* 三禮通釋 [General commentary on the Three Rites] (Guangzhou, 1863).

vessels, music, instruments and movement required elaborate instruction to ensure correct performance, and thus serves our purpose well.

Rather than considering the significance of music in ritual *per se*, the discussion below will focus on the visual information on musical instruments provided in gazetteers, to evaluate the significance of the genre of local gazetteers as source of information on the performance of ritual. The LoGaRT database contains 571 pages with images of musical instruments. Most (over 50%) of these date from two reign periods only: Qianlong and Guangxu.⁸² The set generally includes the following types of instruments: suspended chime stones, including both single suspended chime stones (*texuan qing* 特縣磬) and sets of chime stones (*bianqing* 編磬); suspended bells, included both single suspended bells (*texuan zhong* 特縣鐘) and sets of bells (*bianzhong* 編鐘); two kinds of zither (*se* 瑟 and *qin* 琴); wind and percussion instruments of various kinds; and the ‘starter’ (*zhu* 祝) and ‘stopper’ (*yu* 敔), the two instruments that were used to mark the beginning and end of a ritual musical performance. The stopper, about which more below, always appears in the shape of a crouching tiger on a more or less elaborate pedestal with metal spikes or ‘teeth’ along the ridge of the tiger’s back (formally, 27 teeth), accompanied by a small bamboo brush. Using the brush to hit the tiger’s head, and then running the bamboo brush three times over the teeth on the tiger’s back makes the characteristic sound that marks the end of the ritual. The 1890 gazetteer for Huazhou 化州 includes a two-page illustration of the

⁸² The total number of pages with images of musical instruments break down as follows over the reign periods: Kangxi: 26; Yongzheng: 49; Qianlong: 141; Jiaqing: 55; Daoguang: 38; Xianfeng: 47; Tongzhi: 51; Guangu: 164.

entire set of musical instruments used in ritual, showing not only their physical form but also the quantities of the items to be used (Figure 21).⁸³

The oldest gazetteer depicting musical instruments included in the LoGaRT database is the 1690 edition of the Shangcai county gazetteer (康熙上蔡縣志).⁸⁴ The wooden tiger faces towards the right, crouching low but stretched out, with its tummy flat on the pedestal. The teeth of the tiger are not as clearly visible in this illustration, but they seem to follow the slight curve in the back of the tiger. The tiger is covered with a striped pattern, including a distinct twirl in the fur on the flank of the tiger. The pedestal it sits on is single layered, with a decorative skirt at the bottom of the pedestal (Figure 22). If we compare this late seventeenth-century image with some of the precedents in circulation at this time, its distinctiveness becomes more manifest. The illustration of the stopper in the 1587 edition of *Ming Huidian*, for example, is very different (Figure 23). This tiger faces towards the left, and is more condensed in its crouch, with its back paws nearly touching the elbow of its front paws. The teeth of the tiger stand proud on its back, all the same length and in a straight row. Its fur is less busily marked and lacks the distinctive twirl on the flank. Its pedestal is multi-layered but undecorated. The stopper in the 1622 compilation *Dacheng liyue ji*, at first glance seems very different from the example appearing in the Shangcai county gazetteer: facing towards the left, on a decorative, multi-layered panel, with very distinct whiskers that are absent in the other examples. On the other hand, there are some similarities: the teeth follow the curve along the tiger's back, and there is a distinct twirl on the flank of the tiger. Moreover, the pedestal has a similar decorative skirt at the bottom of

⁸³ Peng Buyang 彭步瀛 and Peng Yisun 彭貽蓀, eds., (*Guangxu*) *Huazhou zhi* 化州志, *Zhongguo fangzhi ku* (1890; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2009), juan 6, 33a-b.

⁸⁴ Zhang Mu 張沐 and Yang Tingwang 楊廷望, eds., (*Kangxi*) *Shangcai Xian zhi* (康熙)上蔡縣志 (1690; repr., Beijing: Beijing Airusheng, 2009).

the pedestal. The illustration of the stopper in the aforementioned *Pangong liyue quanshu*, published in 1656 and intended to instruct the performance of music in local schools, has an entirely different stopper yet again. The tiger is not crouching but lying flat and at rest. Facing leftwards, the face is turned towards the viewer, and whiskers stick out away from the snout. The 27 flat-topped teeth are set in a straight line, and the length of the body seems to be determined by the teeth on the back. A long tail lies in front of the resting tiger, and the single-layered pedestal is undecorated except for a simple skirt. Recognisable, with elements that are similar (the whiskers, and the pedestal) and yet a very distinct and individual shape (Figure 24).

In fact, the images of the stopper included in the depictions of musical instruments in gazetteers are all quite different. If we take the example of the stopper in the versions of the *Sanli tu* that were in circulation during the Ming dynasty, we see the shape of the tiger in simple form, almost curled into a ball, and on a single-tiered pedestal (Figures 25 & 26). The spiky teeth of the tiger follow the curve of the back, and we only see the face side-on. No distinct front or back paws are visible, because the crouch of the tiger's compactness. This image found some followers. The nineteenth-century gazetteer for Changsha county, for example, includes an image of the stopper that copies this example in some ways.⁸⁵ The gazetteer for Yuanjiang county, published in the same year and in the same province, also has more or less the same image, roughly based on the *Sanli tu* example.⁸⁶

Other representations of the tiger follow a very different model, for example with ornate and multi-tiered pedestals. The stopper in the 1530 edition of *Da Ming jili* (first

⁸⁵ Zhao Wenzai 趙文在 and Chen Guangzhao 陳光詔, eds., (*Jiaqing*) *Changsha Xian zhi* (嘉慶)長沙縣志 (1810; repr., Beijing: Beijing Airusheng, 2009), 72.39b.

⁸⁶ Luo Kongzhuan 駱孔僕, (*Jiaqing*) *Yuanjiang Xian zhi* (嘉慶)沅江縣志 (1810; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2009).

compiled during Hongwu), for example, has the flecked tiger crouching on a three-tiered elaborately decorated pedestal, with a long, flecked tail draped along its flank. The teeth follow the curve of the back, the face of the tiger is slightly turned upwards, and small whiskers are discernible (Figure 27).⁸⁷ It is a type of *yu* that appears in several Qing-dynasty gazetteers, too.⁸⁸ Another set of gazetteer images of the stopper closely follow the image of the stopper from the *Huangchao liqi tushi* (Figure 28). Recognizable by the upright position of the head, the straight row of teeth along the tiger's back, and the intricately decorated multi-tiered pedestal, with the layers flaring inwards and out again towards the foot, the image included in the *Da Qing huidian* follows this example closely (Figure 29). The *Huangchao liqi tushi* stopper also inspired numerous gazetteer illustrators.⁸⁹ See, for example, the illustration included in the Guangxu-era Wuqiao county gazetteer (Figure 30): it shares the raised head, the straight row of teeth, the indistinct limbs and the highly decorated pedestal with flaring layers. But it is also distinct: the mouth of the teeth is open and has teeth, but the face has no whiskers; the tail is striped rather than flecked, and the decorations on the pedestal follow a different decorative scheme. One final image (Figure 31) serves to confirm the wide range of images in circulation, and the distinct nature of the gazetteer illustrations. The image of stopper and starter shows the illustrator had some difficulty with perspective: neither the box for the starter nor the pedestal for the stopper

⁸⁷ Xu Yikui 徐一夔, ed., *Da Ming jili 大明集禮*, Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Rare Books Digitization Project-Oversize, 1530, 50.12b.

⁸⁸ Zhang Fuyi 張扶翼 and Wang Guangdian 王光電, eds., (*Yongzheng*) *Qianyang Xian zhi 黔陽縣志*, *Zhongguo fang zhi ku* (1733; repr., Beijing Shi: Beijing Ai ru sheng shu zi hua ji shu yan jiu zhong xin, 2013), 6.30a.

⁸⁹ Zhang Fuyi 張扶翼 and Wang Guangdian 王光電, 6.30a; Pan Xiang 潘相, ed., (*Qianlong*) *Qufu Xian zhi (乾隆) 曲阜縣志* (1774; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2009), tukao.31a; Wang Dixin 王滌心, ed., *Pingshan xian zhi 平山縣續志* (China: s.n., 1854), 4.74a; Chen Fujia 陳福嘉 and Chen Chongdi 陳崇砥, eds., (*Xianfeng*) *Gu'an Xian zhi 固安縣志* (1859; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2009), 4.71a; Jiang Dading 姜大定, ed., (*Tongzhi*) *Anfu Xian zhi 安福縣志* (1869; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2013), 16.62a; Feng Qingyang 馮慶楊 and Ni Changxie 倪昌燮, eds., (*Guangxu*) *Wuqiao Xian zhi 吳橋縣志* (1875; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2009), 2.69a; Chen Yu 陳瑜, (*Guangxu*) *Liping Fu zhi 黎平府志*, ed. Yu Wei 俞渭 (1882; repr., Beijing: Airusheng, 2009), 4.31b.

are entirely successful in creating the shape. And while we know the image of the stopper represents a tiger, seeing this image without its others would make it less easily recognisable. The circular shapes of the teeth on the tiger's back also suggests the illustrator had little sense of what these teeth were intended to do. The illustrator may have seen a model and knew the intention was to create a pedestal with a tiger but will not have had a model close to hand. In their own way, the tigers all form part of a distinct repertoire of images. At the same time, it is also clear that the creators of these illustrations were working within their own circumstances: their skills at creating the illustrations, the models they were working with, and their understanding of the function of the musical instruments were all distinct. That, alone, makes these a very interesting set of sources to consider in discussions of ritual and the genre of local gazetteers.

Final thoughts

The Xiangtan images we started this essay with now make more sense, and we understand them in a different way. The compilers of that gazetteer, under the leadership of Ouyang Zhenghuan, clearly had access to sophisticated illustrators, with a great deal of skill and understanding, who worked as part of a well-resourced project that aimed to show the extent of ritual performance in accordance with the empire-wide emphasis on ritual. The ambitions of the Qianlong emperor are key to understanding the emphasis on ritual during the Qing dynasty, and the publications produced during his reign period, such as the *Illustrated Regulations*, were an important part of his ambitions, as scholars have pointed out. However, it is also clear that the pages with images related to rituals appeared in the local gazetteers at different times and in different cultural spaces from a large-scale imperial

project like *Huangchao liqi tushi*. The Xiangtan gazetteer from Hunan provinces dated 1756 that opened this essay underscores this point. Published three years before the appearance of the *Huangchao liqi tushi* of 1759, and long before the appearance of *Qing huidian tu* in 1811, the images in the Xiangtan gazetteer were created by local men who made their own choices and revealed their own ambitions. The comparison of the tiger and its teeth has shown this to be the case not just for Xiangtan, but for counties scattered throughout the empire. The *Huangchao liqi tushi* is unmistakably a key source for understanding the repertoire of ritual implements during the Qing dynasty, but we cannot rely on it exclusively. If we want to understand what local individuals thought about the importance of ritual in Qing society, including not only those who were responsible for sophisticated gazetteers such as Ouyang Zhenghuan but also the craftsmen responsible for the tiger in Figure 31, we have to take the images of ritual implements included in local gazetteers seriously.

Bibliography

- Bol, Peter K. *Neo-Confucianism in History*. Boston: Harvard University Asia Center, 2008.
- Chen Fujia 陳福嘉 and Chen Chongdi 陳崇砥, eds. (*Xianfeng*) *Gu'an Xian zhi* 固安縣志. 1859. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2009.
- Chen Jiayu 陳嘉榆 and Wang Kaiyun 王闔運, eds. (*Guangxu*) *Xiangtan xian zhi* 光緒湘潭縣志 [(*Guangxu*) *Xiangtan county gazetteer*]. Xuxiu Siku quanshu. 1889. Reprint, Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 2002.
- Chen Yu 陳瑜. (*Guangxu*) *Liping Fu zhi* 黎平府志. Edited by Yu Wei 俞渭. 1882. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2009.
- Chow, Kai-wing. *The Rise of Confucian Ritualism in Late Imperial China: Ethics, Classics, and Lineage Discourse*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1994.
- Dai Jing 戴璟 and Zhang Yue 張岳, eds. (*Jiajing*) *Guangdong tong zhi chu gao* (嘉靖) 廣東通志初稿. Beijing tushuguan guji zhenben congkan. 1535. Reprint, Beijing: Shu mu wen xian chu ban she, 1988.
- Dennis, Joseph. *Writing, Publishing, and Reading Local Gazetteers in Imperial China, 1100-1700*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center: Distributed by Harvard University Press, 2015.
- Ebrey, Patricia Buckley. *Emperor Huizong*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2014.
- Falkenhausen, Lothar von. *Chinese Society in the Age of Confucius (1000-250 BC): The Archaeological Evidence*. ISD LLC, 2006.
- Feng Qingyang 馮慶楊 and Ni Changxie 倪昌燮, eds. (*Guangxu*) *Wuqiao Xian zhi* 吳橋縣志. 1875. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2009.
- Franke, Herbert, ed. *Sung Biographies*. Wiesbaden: Steiner, 1976.
- Guo Fei 郭棐 and Yu Huaizhong 虞懷忠, eds. (*Wanli*) *Sichuan zongzhi* (萬曆) 四川總志 (34 juan). Zhongguo fangzhiku. Wanli. Reprint, Beijing: Beijing Airusheng shuzihua jishu yanjiu zhongxin, 2009.
- Harrist, Robert E. 'The Artist as Antiquarian: Li Gonglin and His Study of Early Chinese Art'. *Artibus Asiae* 55, no. 3/4 (1995): 237–80.
- Hsu, Ya-Hwei. 'Antiquities, Ritual Reform, and the Shaping of New Taste at Huizong's Court'. *Artibus Asiae* 73, no. 1 (2013): 137–80.
- Hsu, Ya-hwei. 'Reshaping Chinese Material Culture: The Revival of Antiquity in the Era of Print, 960–1279'. Ph.D., Yale University, 2010.
- Hsu Ya-Hwei 許雅惠. 'Review of Design by the Book: Chinese Ritual Objects and the "Sanli Tu" by François Louis'. *Journal of Song-Yuan Studies* 47, no. 1 (2017): 227–31.
- 'Huangchao Liqi Tushi 皇朝禮器圖式', Qianlong. British Library, OR 9430.
- Jiang Dading 姜大定, ed. (*Tongzhi*) *Anfu Xian zhi* 安福縣志. 1869. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2013.
- Jin Cheng 金城 and Chen Yu 陳畚, eds. (*Minguo*) *Xinchang xianzhi* 新昌縣志 (20 juan). Zhongguo fangzhi congshu. 1919. Reprint, Taipei: Chengwen chubanshe, 1970.
- Keliher, Macabe. 'Administrative Law and the Making of the First Da Qing Huidian'. *Late Imperial China* 37, no. 1 (2016): 55–107.
- . *The Board of Rites and the Making of Qing China*. Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2019.
- Kerlouégan, Jérôme. 'Printing for Prestige? Publishing and Publications by Ming Princes (Part 3)'. *East Asian Publishing and Society* 2, no. 1 (2012): 3–75.

- Lai Bao 來保, ed. *Qinding Da Qing tongli 欽定大清通禮*. 1756. Reprint, Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983.
- Lai Yu-chih 賴毓芝. 'Tu Yu Li. "Huangchao Liqi Tushi" de Chengli Yu Qi Yingxiang <「圖」與禮··《皇朝禮器圖式》的成立及其影響 [“Illustrations” and the Rites: The Formation of Illustrated Regulations for Ceremonial Paraphernalia of the Imperial Qing Dynasty and Its Influence]'. *National Palace Museum Research Quarterly* 37, no. 2 (2020): 1–56.
- Lam, Joseph S. C. 'Music and Masculinities in Late Ming China'. *Asian Music* 42, no. 2 (2011): 112–34.
- . 'Musical Confucianism: The Case of "Jikong Yuewu"'. In *On Sacred Grounds: Culture, Society, Politics, and the Formation of the Cult of Confucius*, edited by Thomas A Wilson, 134–72. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center, 2002.
- . *State Sacrifices and Music in Ming China: Orthodoxy, Creativity and Expressiveness*. SUNY Series in Chinese Local Studies. Albany, N.Y.: State University of New York Press, 1998.
- Lam, Joseph S.C. 'Huizong's Ritual and Musical Insignia'. *Journal of Ritual Studies* 19, no. 1 (2005): 1–18.
- Li Dongyang 李東陽, ed. *Da Ming hui dian 大明會典*. Beijing: Silijian 司禮監 [Directorate of Ceremonial], 1509.
- Li Dongyang 李東陽 and Shen Shixing 申時行, eds. *Da Ming huidian*. National Library of China -- Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese rare book digitization project. Beijing: Neifu kanben, 1587.
- Li Ningzhong 李寧仲 and Chen Guoru 陳國儒, eds. (*Kangxi*) *Hanyang Fu zhi (康熙) 漢陽府志*. Zhongguo fang zhi ku. 1669. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2013.
- Li Zhizhao 李之藻. *Pangong liyue shu 類宮禮樂疏 [Manual on rites and music at county and prefectural schools]*. 1618. Reprint, Taipei: Guoli zhongyang tushuguan, 1970.
- Liang Bihai 梁碧海 and Liu Yingqi 劉應祁, eds. (*Kangxi*) *Baoqing Fu zhi 寶慶府志*. 1684. Reprint, Beijing: Shumu wenxian chubanshe, 1988.
- Lin Changyi 林昌彝. *Sanli tongshi 三禮通釋 [General commentary on the Three Rites]*. Guangzhou, 1863.
- Liu Damo 劉大謨 and Yang Shen 楊慎, eds. (*Jiajing*) *Sichuan zong zhi (嘉靖) 四川總志*. 1566. Reprint, Beijing: Shumu wenxian chubanshe, 1988.
- Liu Ji 劉績 (jinshi 1490), ed. *San li tu 三禮圖*. Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983.
- Liu Yonghua. *Confucian Rituals and Chinese Villagers: Ritual Change and Social Transformation in a Southeastern Chinese Community, 1368-1949*. Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- Louis, François. *Design by the Book: Chinese Ritual Objects and the Sanli Tu*. New York: Bard Graduate Center, 2016.
- Lü Huashun 呂化舜, Kong Yanfa 孔衍法, and Kong Yanzhi 孔衍治, eds. *Dongye zhi 東野誌*. National Library of China -- Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese rare book digitization project, 1689.
- Lü Zengnan 呂曾柎, and Liu Zuoliang 劉作樑, eds. (*Kangxi*) *Xinchang Xianzhi 新昌縣志 (18 juan)*. Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project-Shanben fangzhi, 1671.

- Luo Kongzhuan 駱孔僎. (*Jiaqing*) *Yuanjiang Xian zhi* (嘉慶) 沅江縣志. 1810. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2009.
- McMullen, David. 'The Role of the Zhouli in Seventh- and Eighth-Century Civil Administrative Traditions'. In *Statecraft and Classical Learning: The Rituals of Zhou in East Asian History*, edited by Benjamin A. Elman and Martin Kern, 181–228. Leiden: Brill, 2010.
- Mei Yantao 梅彥騫 and Li Baozhen 李葆貞, eds. (*Shunzhi*) *Pucheng xianzhi* (順治) 浦城縣志. 1651. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2009.
- Mo Dan 莫旦, ed. (*Jiajing*) *Xinchang xianzhi* 新昌縣志 (16 juan), 1521.
- Nie Chongyi 聶崇義. *Sanli tu jizhu* 三禮圖集注 [Collected commentaries on the Illustrations to Three Ritual Classics]. Vol. 129. Yingyin Wenyuange Sikuquanshu. 961. Reprint, Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983.
- Ouyang Zhenghuan 歐陽正煥 and Lü Zhengyin 呂正音, eds. *Xiangtan xian zhi* 湘潭縣志. Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project (Shanben fangzhi), 1756.
- Pan Xiang 潘相, ed. (*Qianlong*) *Qufu Xian zhi* (乾隆) 曲阜縣志. 1774. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2009.
- Peng Buying 彭步瀛 and Peng Yisun 彭貽蓀, eds. (*Guangxu*) *Huazhou zhi* 化州志. Zhongguo fangzhi ku. 1890. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2009.
- Qu Jiushi 瞿九思. *Kongmiao liyue kao* 孔廟禮樂考. Xuxiu Sikuquanshu. 1609. Reprint, Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 2002.
- Rawson, Jessica. 'Ornament in China'. In *A Companion to Chinese Art*, edited by Martin Powers and Katherine R. Tsiang, 371–91. Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons Inc, 2015.
- . *The British Museum Book of Chinese Art*. 2nd ed. London: British museum Press, 2007.
- Shen Shixing 申時行, ed. *Ming hui dian* 明會典. Guoxue jiben congshu. 1587. Reprint, Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1968.
- Shi Jishi 史記事. *Da Cheng Li Yue Ji* 大成禮樂集, 1622.
- Smith, Richard J. *Mapping China and Managing the World: Culture, Cartography and Cosmology in Late Imperial Times*. New York: Routledge, 2013.
- . 'Ritual in Ch'ing Culture'. In *Orthodoxy in Late Imperial China*, edited by Kwang-Ching Liu, 281–310. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 1991.
- Standaert, Nicolas. 'Ritual Dances and Their Visual Representations in the Ming and the Qing'. *The East Asian Library Journal* 12, no. 1 (2006): 68–181.
- Tian Guan 田瑄, ed. (*Wanli*) *Xinchang xianzhi* (萬曆) 新昌縣志 (13 juan). 1579. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2009.
- Wan Tinglan 萬廷蘭 and Yang Wenfeng 楊文峰, eds. (*Qianlong*) *Xinchang xianzhi* (乾隆) 新昌縣志 (25 juan). 1793. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2013.
- Wang Dixin 王滌心, ed. *Pingshan xian zhi* 平山縣續志. China: s.n., 1854.
- Wang, Tao. 'Matter of Things: How to Read Ancient Chinese Bronzes'. In *Mirroring China's Past: Emperors, Scholars, and Their Bronzes = Ji Jin Jian Gu / Tao Wang ; with Essays by Sarah Allan, Jeffrey Moser, Su Rongyu, Edward L. Shaughnessy, Zhixin Jason Sun, Zhou Ya, Liu Yu, and Lu Zhang.*, edited by Tao Wang, 17–31. Chicago: The Art Institute of Chicago, 2018.
- Wang Zhou 王州, and Wang Yaohua 王耀华. 'Kongmiao Liyue de Dingwei, Shijian Ji Qi Wenhua Neihan: Yi Mingdai Wenxian 《Kongmiao Liyue Kao》 《Dacheng Liyue Ji》

- kaocha Wei Zhongxin 孔庙礼乐的定位、实践及其文化内涵——以明代文献《孔庙礼乐考》《大成礼乐集》考察为中心'. *Zhongguo Yinyue Xue*, no. 1 (2017): 37–41.
- Wechsler, Howard J. *Offerings of Jade and Silk: Ritual and Symbol in the Legitimation of the T'ang Dynasty*. New Haven; London: Yale University Press, 1985.
- Wu, Ben. 'Ritual Music in the Court and Rulership of the Qing Dynasty (1644-1911)'. PhD, University of Pittsburgh, 1998.
- Wu, Guo. *An Anthropological Inquiry into Confucianism: Ritual, Emotion, and Rational Principle*. Lanham, Maryland: Lexington Books, 2022.
- Wu Hung. 'Practice and Discourse: Ritual Vessels in a Fourth-Century BCE Chinese Tomb'. In *Vessels: The Object as Container*, edited by Claudia Brittenham, 120–71. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019.
- . 'The Art of "Ritual Artifacts" (Liqi): Discourse and Practice'. In *A Companion to Chinese Art*, edited by Martin Powers and Katherine R. Tsiang, 233–53. Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, 2016.
- Xiao Song 蕭嵩 (d. 749). *Da Tang Kaiyuan li 大唐開元禮 [Ritual Code of the Kaiyuan Period in the Great Tang]*. 732. Reprint, Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1978.
- Xu Yikui 徐一夔, ed. *Da Ming jili 大明集禮*. Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Rare Books Digitization Project-Oversize, 1530.
- Yu Huichun. 'Qianlong's Divine Treasures: The Bells in Rhyming-the-Old Hall'. *Asia Major* 22, no. 2 (2009): 121–44.
- Yu Hui-chun 余慧君. 'Bronzes from Afar Ch'ien-Lung's Hsi-Ch'ing Hsü-Chien Chia-Pien Fu-Lu'. *Guoli Taiwan Daxue Meishu Shi Yanjiu Jikan 國立臺灣大學美術史研究集刊* 31 (2011): 151–204.
- Yuan, Zujie. 'Dressing for Power: Rite, Costume, and State Authority in Ming Dynasty China'. *Frontiers of History in China* 2, no. 2 (2007): 181–212.
- Yunlu 允祿 and Fulong'an 福隆安, eds. *Huangchao liqi tushi 皇朝禮器圖式 [Illustrated Regulations for Ceremonial Paraphernalia of the Qing Dynasty]*. 1759. Reprint, Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983.
- Yuzhi lülü zhengyi 御製律呂正義 [Imperially improved standard interpretation of music theory]. Yingyin Wenyuange Sikuquanshu. 1724. Reprint, Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan, 1983.
- Zhang Anmao 張安茂. *Pangong liyue quanshu 類宮禮樂全書 [Complete Description of the Rites and Music for the Ceremonials [Offered to Confucius] in Local Schools]*. Siku quanshu cunmu congshu. 1656. Reprint, Jinan: Qi Lu shushe chubanshe, 1997.
- Zhang Fuyi 張扶翼 and Wang Guangdian 王光電, eds. *(Yongzheng) Qianyang Xian zhi 黔陽縣志*. *Zhongguo fang zhi ku*. 1733. Reprint, Beijing Shi: Beijing Ai ru sheng shu zi hua ji shu yan jiu zhong xin, 2013.
- Zhang Ke 张珂. 'Huangchao Liqi Tushi Zhong de Yueqi 《皇朝礼器图式》中的乐器'. *Gehai*, no. 05 (2016): 38–42.
- Zhang Kuihua 張奎華. *Yunmeng xian zhi 雲夢縣志*. Edited by Chen Mengzhou 陳夢舟. 1668. Reprint, Beijing: Xianzhuang shuju, 2001.
- Zhang Mu 張沐 and Yang Tingwang 楊廷望, eds. *(Kangxi) Shangcai Xian zhi (康熙)上蔡縣志*. 1690. Reprint, Beijing: Beijing Airusheng, 2009.
- Zhao, Haoyang. 'Art Historical and Provenance Research in a Case Study of Huangchao Liqi Tushi'. *Journal for Art Market Studies* 4, no. 2 (2020).

- Zhao Wenzai 趙文在 and Chen Guangzhao 陳光詔, eds. *(Jiaqing) Changsha Xian zhi (嘉慶) 長沙縣志*. 1810. Reprint, Beijing: Beijing Airusheng, 2009.
- Zhu Qing'e 朱慶萼, ed. *(Tongzhi) Xianchang xianzhi (同治) 新昌縣志 (32 juan)*. 1872. Reprint, Beijing: Airusheng, 2013.
- Zito, Angela. *Of Body and Brush: Grand Sacrifice as Text/Performance in Eighteenth-Century China*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998.